

Century. At over 100 US\$ for 200 odd pages, this paperback is certainly not inexpensive (though I do note that its purchase price is discounted for member of CILIP – the UK’s library and information association. Perhaps some sort of arrangement could be made with ASA for this and other publications?). Even so, I have no qualms in recommending that every recordkeeping professional should try to get hold of a copy and consider its implications. Apart from being a thought-provoking and insightful read, it provides clarity for those trying to advocate for recordkeeping while negotiating the cultural shifts towards information and data as pre-eminent paradigms. In particular, it positions us to use the vocabulary of information and data when ‘... politically necessary, while remaining aware that it offers an inadequate basis for reflective professional thinking about records and record-keeping’ (p. 199).

Gregory Rolan

Monash University

 greg.rolan@monash.edu

© 2020 Gregory Rolan

<https://doi.org/10.1080/01576895.2020.1808752>



Permanent record, by Edward Snowden, New York, Metropolitan Books, 2019, viii, 239 pp., \$US17.99 (hardback), ISBN: 978-1-250-23723-1

Edward Snowden’s *Permanent Record* is the story of a whistleblower’s betrayal of covert intelligence gathering programmes originating in the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) and National Security Agency (NSA). Programmes that he argues aimed to implement a step change in the very basis of American espionage. In Snowden’s words, to move espionage from ‘targeted surveillance of individuals to mass surveillance of entire populations’ (p. 1). Edward Snowden was a systems engineer and architect, the kind of person NSA and CIA needed to transition from human to computer and network based intelligence gathering. In his own words, Snowden’s role in this transformation was to: ‘Make it technologically feasible for a single government to collect all the world’s digital communications, store them for ages and search through them at will’ (p. 1).

Snowden grew up in a respectable middle-class family that valued patriotism and service, values that caused him to respond to his nation’s call after the 11 September 2001 terrorist attacks in New York and Washington. Over the course of multiple jobs as a contractor with CIA and NSA between 2006 and 2013, Snowden became increasingly disillusioned with the surveillance implications of America’s ‘war on terror’. Disturbed by what he perceived as a gross betrayal of the public interest, Edward Snowden went public on NSA and CIA’s covert programme of mass surveillance in 2013. On 6 June, *The Guardian* published details of NSA’s harvesting of phone records from over 120 million Verizon subscribers¹. The following day, in a second disclosure published simultaneously by *The Guardian* and *The Washington Post*, Snowden revealed project PRISM, a surveillance program that collected email, voice, text and video chats of US and other users of common collaboration and communications tools created by Microsoft, Google, Facebook, Yahoo, Apple and other tech companies². Further disclosures detailed operational systems that searched and analysed global Internet data (codenamed Xkeyscore), intercepted undersea and other data communications links (code-named Tempora & Muscular) or established co-operative agreements between Five Eyes (FVEY)³ partners with each other and others for the collection and sharing of mass and targeted surveillance information (codenamed Project 6, Stateroom and Lustre)⁴.

Claims made by Snowden about these systems relied upon evidence found in a personal 'archive' of top secret documents created by Snowden, whilst employed by Booz Allen Hamilton, a leading defence and intelligence contractor in the United States (p. 277). These documents not only shed light on programmes operating in the United States, but included Australian, British and Canadian files, accessed by Snowden through the Five Eyes security and intelligence sharing network⁵. In aggregate, the US intelligence establishment claimed that up to 1.77 million documents had been stolen, a figure subsequently disputed by Snowden. Fleeing the United States with his personal 'archive', Snowden found refuge in Russia where he has since lived in exile.

According to *Permanent Record*, Edward Snowden's career in intelligence began in 2006 when he accepted a position at the CIA (p. 2). Three years later he resigned from the CIA to work under cover as a contractor to Dell, where he began to architect and engineer systems infrastructure that 'would keep a permanent record of everyone's life' (p. 3). In the first instance, this work entailed the development of cloud-based infrastructure for backing up, accessing, sharing and keeping surveillance data with continuing value. Later work involved the powerful and intrusive system known as Xkeyscore, a system which could be used to search 'nearly everything a user does on the Internet'. Xkeyscore was a system with chilling implications:

It was, simply put, the closest thing to science fiction I have ever seen in science fact: an interface that allows you to type in pretty much anyone's address, telephone number, IP number and go through the recent history of their online activity. In some cases, you could even play back recordings of their online sessions, so that the screen you were looking at was their screen, whatever was on the desktop. You could read their emails, their browser history, their social media postings, everything (p. 279).

Edward Snowden's *Permanent Record* is very much a personal testimony of why the renegade acts of acquiring a personal archive of sensitive NSA and CIA records and its subsequent disclosure was necessary in the public interest. To a lesser extent, *Permanent Record* is an autobiography of the man and events behind the theft and disclosure. It is also a commentary on the harnessing of surveillance capitalism to the mass surveillance needs of the State. It is a nostalgic work, rooted in the life experience of a man who grew up in the era of an immature Internet full of creative opportunity and surrounded by optimism. Harnessed to the cause of national security after the events of 9/11, Snowden became nonetheless increasingly disillusioned with the scope and ambition of covert intelligence gathering, which he saw as betraying the earlier promise of the Internet as a force for good.

Written as a memoir for a broad audience, *Permanent Record* is also noteworthy as a case study in radical archives, in this case authored by a non-archivist. Although the term archive is used in the book restrictively in reference to the backing-up of intelligence data or in reference to the cache of stolen documents, it is plain that Snowden was hard at work 'designing the archive' of mass surveillance, a task that ended in disillusionment, moral revulsion and conviction that he must expose the threat to civil liberty and democracy that this work entailed. From the selection of the book's title to a lengthy discussion of whether the digital footprints of individuals on the Internet should be kept or erased, there are many discussions in the book with archival implications and which make this work a compelling and obligatory read. Repelled as he was by the scope and implications of mass surveillance, Snowden's views on expungement vs. retention are nonetheless complex and resistant to the simple solution of 'hitting the delete key'. Because of his knowledge of programming and cybersecurity, the delete key option was more available to him than most. Confronting the issue of his own digital footprints and regrets about comments made on gaming and hacker sites as a young man, Snowden concluded:

I decided to leave the comments up and figure out how to live with them. I even decided that true fidelity to this stance would require me to continue posting. In time, I would outgrow these new opinions, too, but my initial impulse remains unshakeable, if only because it was an important step in my own maturity. We can't erase the things that shame us, or the ways we've shamed ourselves online. All we can do is control our reactions – whether we let the past oppress us or accept its lessons, grow and move on (p. 97).

In summary, *Permanent Record* is an intelligent and passionate book with much to offer on the capabilities, dilemmas and dangers of the 'mass surveillance archive'. It extends our understanding of fugitive or radical archives originating from covert security and intelligence gathering programmes supposedly operating within the checks and balances of a liberal democratic framework. It is illustrative of how designing the archive is converging with systems architecture and engineering, skill sets far removed from what archivists are taught in our learning programs. It is also written from the bleeding edge of innovation, where there is an abundance of money to build systems solutions for data and records, and where the morality of doing so is all too often contentious.

It is by no means a perfect book. My copy contained no appendix of acronyms used in the text and in the intelligence community these proliferate. So, I spent a lot of time tracking down explanations of acronyms used. The inclusion of an index would also have contributed to reader satisfaction and usefulness. Reflecting on content scope, capabilities that underpin the surveillance state are dealt with selectively – there's lots on data interception and harvesting of personal data from compliant platform providers, exploitation of the Internet of Things (IoT) as a surveillance platform using malware – but the use of AI and data extraction capabilities less so. By way of coming to the work, it is worth reading or revisiting Cassie Findlay's 2013 article, 'People, records and power', which explores radical archives and provides essential background through the lens of a similar case study, WikiLeaks⁶.

With a functioning data retention regime since 2015 for all user communications and Internet use, and a host of security laws, Australia has acquired capacities that are key enablers of Edward Snowden's mass surveillance archive. The appetite of our politicians for increasingly intrusive and potentially harmful security laws seems endless. However this political narrative plays out, there will be further decisions and debates along the way about the 'mass surveillance archive' and this book will help advocates and professionals get onto the front foot and contribute intelligently to this discussion. It is highly recommended.

Notes

1. Glenn Greenwald, 'NSA collecting phone records of millions of Verizon customers daily', *The Guardian*, 6 June 2013, available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jun/06/nsa-phone-records-verizon-court-order>>, accessed 20 February 2020.
2. Barton Gellman and Laura Poitras, 'US Intelligence Mining Data from Nine U.S. Internet Companies in Broad Secret Program', *The Washington Post*, 7 June 2013, available at <https://www.washingtonpost.com/investigations/us-intelligence-mining-data-from-nine-us-internet-companies-in-broad-secret-program/2013/06/06/3a0c0da8-cebf-11e2-8845-d970ccb04497_story.html>, accessed 20 February 2020.
3. 'Five Eyes', *Wikipedia*, 2020, available at <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Five_Eyes>, accessed 20 February 2020.
4. 'Global surveillance disclosures (2013-present)', *Wikipedia*, 2020, available at <[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Global_surveillance_disclosures_\(2013-present\)#cite_note-488](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Global_surveillance_disclosures_(2013-present)#cite_note-488)>, accessed 20 February 2020.

5. 'Who holds security clearances?', *The Washington Post*, 10 June 2013, available at <https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/who-holds-security-clearances/2013/06/10/983744e4-d232-11e2-a73e-826d299ff459_graphic.html>, accessed 20 February 2020.
6. Cassie Findlay, 'People, records and power: What archives can learn from WikiLeaks', *Archives and Manuscripts*, vol. 41, no. 1, pp. 7–22.

Mark Brogan

 www.brogan.id.au

 mbrogan@iinet.net.au

© 2020 Mark Brogan

<https://doi.org/10.1080/01576895.2020.1741012>



Shadow archives: the lifecycles of African American Literature, by Jean-Christophe Cloutier, Columbia University Press, New York, 2019, 408 pp., US\$35 (paperback), ISBN 9780231193313

There are two ways of reading Jean-Christophe Cloutier's *Shadow Archives: The Lifecycles of African American Literature* – first, from the archival perspective, and, second, from the literary perspective. Neither perspective detracts from Cloutier's ability to weave together very compelling stories from his archival searches, but the differences are there and can shift how the reader (if an archivist) takes in the book.

What may stand out in the title for an archivist is the use of the term lifecycles, a term that means something very specific in archival studies. Cloutier makes the concept of the archival lifecycle central to his argument. It is here that reading from an archival perspective manifests itself. Taking Schellenberg's *Modern Archives* as a springboard, Cloutier uses the lifecycle concept to describe the literary works and archival drive of four African American writers from the 1930s-1950s: Claude McKay, Richard Wright, Ralph Ellison and Ann Petry, as well as Ellison's work with photographer Gordon Parks. Cloutier ties together the writings of Schellenberg and his subject through the era that produced them all, while relying heavily on lifecycle metaphors to describe how the archives of each author was created and deposited at various libraries in the United States.

Cloutier himself has some experience working in archives, having been an intern at the Columbia University library, and it is clear that creativity and excitement was sparked within him from this period. His writing, however, exists outside the archival studies field. Cloutier does cite some well-known archivists and archival journals, primarily in the introduction. After this, the citation of archivists or archival theory essentially vanishes. Given the citations he uses, it is unclear if this book will draw non-archivists into the vast literature written by archivists on similar subjects. It is obvious though in reading the book that 'the archive' as subject matter here never strays far from the literal definition of the personal papers of the authors in question. While it is at times perhaps too elementary for experienced archivists, there are still elements that are not only enjoyable to read but can also have an impact on the field.

For the readers of this journal, the introduction to the lifecycle would be well-worn territory, while for most readers of the book, the introduction to the lifecycle would most likely be the first foray into anything approaching archival theory. From the archival perspective, this reliance on the lifecycle model as a central narrative force lessens some of the impact of the book. The records continuum makes one appearance